
Minutes of X3J14 Meeting #7

*ANS Forth Technical Committee
January 25-28, 1989, Los Angeles, California
Doc. no: X3J14/89-002*

Call To Order

Ms. Rather welcomed the X3J14 Technical Committee. She reminded the committee that Chuck Moore, the inventor of Forth, would be addressing the committee after lunch. There were 18 voting members at this meeting. The attendance list for this meeting is document X3J14/89-003. Martin Lascelles and John Hayes are now voting members.

The minutes of X3J14 Meeting #6 were corrected and adopted as amended.

Action Item Review From Meeting #6

1. Missing proposals were sent to Mr. Colburn, Mr. Keane, and Mr. Ragsdale.
2. Mr. Nemeth prepared a solicitation for field trials. It has not been mailed to anyone, but has been posted on several bulletin boards and some volunteers have come in.
3. We are sending "What is BASIS" with all copies mailed to non-TC members.
4. Mr. Tracy is collecting status information from those who sign in as meeting attendees.
5. The following members have submitted proposals on their assigned "burning issues":
Rather, Tracy, Shaw, Duncan, Kobziar.

Most rationales went unwritten, except those by Mr. Kobziar. Action items not completed were added to the action item list of this meeting.

Mr. Duncan suggested that we date-stamp proposal logs. The price of BASIS is now \$6. Bob Davis and Marty Freeman were inadvertently billed for dropping in at the last meeting. We will be more careful in distinguishing visitors from observers in the future.

Logistics Report

Mr. Betts reported that Dave Petty agreed to be our host for the next meeting, which will be in Boston, May 3 – 6. He suggested that the next January meeting be in Hawaii. The suggestion was enthusiastically received.

Documentation Report

Mr. Dickens reported that BASIS is getting a lot cleaner. He worked with Mr. Bailey to produce a concordance, which will be a regular feature. He announced that there would be a documentation committee meeting.

Research Committee Report

Mr. Rash, speaking for Mr. Nemeth, reported that GENIE was informed that it will be dropped as a debating medium. The field trials are off to a poor start. Each field trial needs to have a sponsor to prepare the packet which includes proposals, additional proposals, rationale, and questions that need to be answered. They should be mailed to chair of research committee, Mr. Nemeth. The Research Committee will distribute the packets and collect the results.

It was moved to approve this procedure. Mr. Bailey amended the motion to require packet submittal within 15 days following the meeting. Mr. Tracy suggested that the Research Committee give a status report of all field trials at each meeting. The amended motion passed 16/0/1.

A call for field trial volunteers was published by Mr. Shaw and posted on national electronic bulletin boards by Mr. Tracy. The only response so far has been from the Palo Alto Shipping company. Mr. Shaw has a list of volunteers. Mr. Tracy presented the local variables proposal at FORML. A list of Forth vendors with 200 or more users has been contacted. Some vendors have not responded. Mr. Colburn sent his response to Mr. Nemeth, but it was not further disseminated.

Ms. Rather reported that Mr. Dennis Ruffer's letter requests posting BASIS on GENIE in electronic form. There was discussion that this would allow copies to be printed without control. Critical formatting required to understand the document might be lost. Mr. Dickens offered to write Mr. Ruffer and tell him nicely no. Ms. Rather reminded us that SPARC feels we should severely limit distribution.

Technical Subcommittee Report

79 proposals are now actionable. There are 31 new proposals.

ISO Report

Mr. Rash, speaking for Dr. Dorband, reported that Fast Track is our best bet. The five-member ISO committee did not know whether their countries were interested, but will let us know. It was agreed to continue to lay low for now, until dpANS is completed. Members of the ANSI C committee estimate they have lost 2-3 years through internationalization. Europeans who wish to be involved in X3J14 are welcome to submit proposals. Mr. Tracy agreed to publish a notice in *Dr. Dobb's Journal* that "international proposals are welcome," with a reminder that we are trying to get a dpANS together by next Fall.

Review of the Proposal Handling Process

Ms. Rather reported that several people have expressed concern about the number of proposals going from conception to approval within a single meeting. She suggested that we deal with proposals earlier in the meeting. A great deal of discussion followed.

Approximately \$50,000 in man-hours are expended in the four day meeting. Do we get that much done? We are busy between meetings too. It would be a shame to take any action that would slow us down. If we are going to submit lots of proposals now that can't be acted on until May, that would be drastic. Anyone here can invoke the two-week rule if they need more time. But we shouldn't routinely invoke this rule for the benefit of someone who isn't at the meeting. We don't want anyone to claim that due process was not followed.

Mr. Baden reported on a long phone call from Mr. Keane. Mr. Keane is concerned about a rush to judgement. Ms. Rather asked how members who have missed meetings feel? Several agreed that rushing to judgment was not a problem. Mr. Keane feels that when the TC votes, it should be at the next meeting. Mr. Colburn countered that he could always propose a change to what he didn't like, provided he had a compelling reason. Mr. Bailey said that he wasn't comfortable about waiting three months just after an issue was discussed. Ms. Rather commented that our representation is pretty good, 17 or 18 out of 25 members at most meetings.

It was generally agreed that no procedural change was called for.

Other Business

Ms. Rather reported that the Forth Vendors Group (FVG) is still solvent, and provided a financial report. Mr. Shaw raised the possibility of Forth Standards Team (FST) money going to the FVG for support of X3J14. There was some discussion about who needed the money, and for what. It was moved that we not accept outside contributions, and that Ms. Rather write FST a letter declining any contribution. The motion passed 14/1/2.

Mr. Forsley announced that the *Journal of Forth Applications and Research* (JFAR) will be publishing the unedited minutes of the X3J14 meetings.

Mr. Dickens moved to put an expiration date on the front cover of BASIS. Ms. Rather amended the motion to specify that the old BASIS expires at the beginning of each scheduled meeting. The motion passed 16/0/0. Ms. Rather further clarified that the new BASIS is adopted when the minutes are.

Mr. Dickens has written a visitor's guide to TC and TSC meetings. Ms. Rather requested the Logistics Committee to copy and distribute this at meetings.

Ms. Rather announced a one time offer of a subscription to the next four versions of BASIS at \$30. She will send postcards about this to anyone who has bought a BASIS so far. Postcards will also be sent to the vendors list.

Address by Chuck Moore

Mr. Moore requested some time to address the TC on a variety of issues. An edited excerpt of the principal points of this address is provided as a separate document.

In summary, Mr. Moore apologized for dropping out of regular attendance at TC meetings. He is vitally concerned that we produce a good standard, but doesn't feel comfortable voting. He provided a detailed critique of the current BASIS, and recommended that we ask objective outsiders to provide similar critiques at future meetings.

Ms. Rather thanked Mr. Moore for his helpful comments. She hoped he would continue on the TC, or would at least visit whenever it met on the West Coast. Mr. Moore agreed to stay involved, even though he would not be voting.

Action on Technical Proposals

TP#	Name	Status	Action
TP-17	Aliases for double word.	withdrawn.	
TP-20	Mini list of data types	withdrawn.	
TP-178	Forth concepts	withdrawn.	
TP-194.2	String buffers cleanup	passed 17/0/0.	
TP-194.4A	String buffers cleanup	passed 17/1/0.	
TP-195A	PAUSE and its children	passed 18/0/0.	RB rationale
TP-199	Numbers are words, too	withdrawn.	
TP-202	Omnibus proposal	failed 0/18/0	Resubmit concepts
TP-211A	Replace "number types"	passed 17/0/0.	
TP-218A	Move PICK and ROLL to CRW*.	passed 15/1/0.	
TP-222A	All the right MOVES II	failed 0/13/3.	
TP-226	Eliminate EXPECT problems.	failed 2/12/2.	
TP-248A	Data type specification	passed 16/1/0.	
TP-250A	Make 2* Required and D2* Double	passed 15/2/0.	
TP-251A	Add @EXECUTE to CRW	passed 14/3/0.	
TP-252A	Specify pictured numeric output data area	passed 17/0/0.	
TP-253	Require 2ROT	failed 5/12/0.	
TP-255.1A	Mixed-precision arithmetic	passed 16/1/0.	
TP-255.2A	Mixed-precision (M-)	passed 15/2/0.	
TP-255.3A	Mixed-precision (NORM)	failed 5/11/0.	
TP-256A	Post proposals	passed 17/0/0.	

* Controlled Reference Wordset

TP#	Name	Status	Action
TP-259A	Fix END-CODE	passed 14/2/0.	
TP-261	Environmental standard	failed 1/16/0.	
TP-264	Concepts section	passed 17/0/0.	
TP-267A	WITHIN	passed 16/1/0.	
TP-268	Move D>S to the Required Wordset	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-269A	DLITERAL	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-270	Delete ROLL	withdrawn.	
TP-271A	Mixed-precision operators	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-272	Specification of double numbers	passed 17/1/0.	
TP-273A	Implementation of EVALUATE	passed 17/1/0.	
TP-274A	Manners and expectations	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-275A	Forget FORGET	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-276	Make READ-LINE efficient	passed 17/1/0.	
TP-277	Non-addressable space	passed 18/0/0.	ML rationale.
TP-278A	Using data type notation	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-279A	Control flow	passed 16/2/0.	
TP-280	Completing stack operators	failed 0/18/0.	
TP-281	Stack primitives considered	reabeled as comment.	
TP-282A	Multiprogramming impact	passed 18/0/0.	
TP-283A	Cleanup error handling	passed 16/0/0.	
TP-284	Post proposals	passed 17/0/0.	MT letter
TP-290	Add PERFORM to CRW	passed 13/3/0.	
TP-291	Provide high-speed math	failed 0/16/0.	
TP-296A	;CODE isn't revealing	passed 15/1/0.	
TP-297	Pictured numeric output	passed 16/0/0.	
TP-298	Dots ... revisited	reabeled as comment.	
TP-300	Minimums	passed 16/0/0.	

Notes: concepts to Mr. Braithwaite by Thursday.

Action Items

1. Documentation Committee will date stamp the front page of BASIS.
2. Ms. Rather will remove casual visitors from the mailing list.
3. Ms. Rather will write a "thanks but no thanks" letter to the Forth Standards Team.
4. Mr. Tracy will call Mr. Rodriguez about TP-284.
5. Mr. Betts will contact the Boston FIG to confirm the next TC meeting there.
6. The FVG will offer a \$30 one time only annual subscription for the next four versions of BASIS which will expire the first day of the next meeting.
7. This offer will be advertised to FIG chapters and to the vendors list.
8. Mr. Dickens will write Mr. Ruffer a letter politely declining his offer to post the BASIS in electronic form.

Action Items Held Over From Last Meeting

1. Mr. Dickens to ask Mr. Cramer to respond to TC-124.
2. Mr. Tracy to see that the notation "revised BASIS" is removed from TP-053 and TP-054.
3. Mr. Dorband to write to SMC volunteering as ISO Representative if he has not done so.

4. All members to prepare proposals on their assigned "Burning Issues" from the list below.

Burning Issues

Counts represent the number of TC members who could not approve BASIS as a dpANS unless the particular issue is resolved. Unless at least one proposal is already pending on an issue, the initials represent a member who has volunteered to prepare proposals addressing it.

Count	Issue	Assignment/Status
12	Vocabularies	action pending
10	Compilation issues	action pending
10	Reduce Required Wordset by eight words	DC
9	Input stream	action pending
9	Organization of word sets	deferred
8	Boolean data types	GB
8	Rationale	ER
8	Portability discipline	GB
7	Signed/unsigned division.	action pending
7	Immediacy	DC
7	Alignment	action pending
7	Bytes vs characters	TD
6	Address spaces	action pending
5	ROMability	MT
5	Error handling	action pending
5	String operations	action pending
4	Multitasking	AK
4	Local variables	LF
4	Flow of Control	GS
3	Concepts	JR
2	File vs BLOCK issues	GS
2	Number conversion.	ER
1	Provider requirements	TD

Next Meeting

The next meeting will be May 3-6, 1989, in Boston. Dave Petty will be the host.

Adjournment

The seventh meeting of the X3J14 ANS Forth Technical Committee was adjourned at 6:00 P.M., on Saturday, January 28, 1989.

Submitted by: Martin Tracy, Secretary.